MINISTÈRE DE L’ÉDUCATION NATIONALE,
DE LA JEUNESSE ET DES SPORTS
HÂITI

Projet d’élaboration du
PLAN NATIONAL
ÉDUCATION 2004

TECHNICAL
DIAGNOSIS
OF THE
HAITIAN
EDUCATIONAL
SYSTEM
September 1995

SUMMARY OF CONCLUSIONS
AND RECOMMENDATIONS

preparing by
Research Triangle Institute
The Academy for Educational Development
Educat S.A.

This work was prepared as part of the USAID-funded programme of
Technical Assistance to the National Education Planning and Reform Process
(USAID Cooperative Agreement No. 521-0190-A-00-4037-0)
ACKNOWLEDGEMENTS

We take great pleasure in thanking all those who contributed to making possible the technical diagnosis of the Haitian education system summarized in this report. Their support and involvement was essential to the completion of this work.

We must first thank the Minister of Education Emmanuel Buteau, who ensured that relevant Ministry files were made available to the Diagnosis team. The climate of transparency created in his Ministry also facilitated the team’s exchanges with the directors and chiefs of services of the central and departmental units.

We would also like to extend thanks to Rebecca Adams and Yves Joseph of the USAID mission in Haiti. The level of technical interest and insight they provided throughout the eight months of work in Port-au-Prince and the Departments, as well as their moral support, are gratefully acknowledged and very much appreciated.

This diagnosis was undertaken in the context of activities of the National Plan of Education 2004. We thank Charles Tardieu, the Coordinator of the Executive Bureau of PNE 2004, and Marie-Carmelle Coupet and Florence Jean-Louis, his immediate collaborators at the Bureau, for the frequent and frank exchanges that were essential to the strategic aspects of our work and to its integration in the larger process of participation. The support of the Executive Bureau’s technical consultants, notably Gisèle Pierre, Mireille Nicolas, Nancy Dorsainvil, Monique Joseph, Emmanuel Eloi, Reine Leroy, and Mona Bass (on detachment from the MENJS) is also acknowledged. The work of these PNE 2004 consultants, who participated in the field work with the RTI / AED / Educat team, contributed significantly to the success of the undertaking.

The technical and logistical support granted by UNESCO throughout this endeavor also deserves special thanks. UNESCO provided office and meeting space for the Diagnosis team in Port-au-Prince and UNESCO staff and consultants participated in several Diagnosis team meetings. Our team benefitted considerably from the fruitful exchanges with UNESCO Resident Representative Arvélio Garcia Rivas, administrator Jorge Ivan Espinal, and consultants Catherine Grigsby, Dominique Alter, and Magdalena Herdoiza. In addition, we thank Mabiala Ma Umba of UNICEF for his interest and cooperation.

We would like to acknowledge the active and enlightened support and collaboration of Marc Antoine Alix, the Director General of the MENJS, and of his staff Reynold Telfort and Roseline Déjean. Their support and cooperation made it possible to examine closely the issues related to the public administration of education in Haiti. Thanks are due also to MENJS Directors and Bureau Heads Marie Hélène Gabriel (DEF), Claudette Mesidor (BUGEP), Lyonel Sanon (DES), Jérôme Dominique (DFP), Mr Lerebourg (DAA), Jean Gouin (DEP), Nanie Piou (BCEP), Jean-Ariel Joseph (BUNEXE), Jean Marie Montés (DPCE), René Midy (Génie Scolaire), Jean-Claude Chéry (Radio Scolaire), and the Directors of the ten Directions Départementales of the MENJS, and to Myrto Célestin-Saurel, Director of UPED.

We would also like to extend our appreciation to the members of the Group de Réflexion Stratégique (GRS). Although the GRS did not participate directly in the diagnosis, the diagnosis team received important insights and feedback through its work of reflection and analysis as well as through individual exchanges with some of its members. We would especially like to thank GRS members
We have also found the representatives of the private sector to be wise and cooperative partners, and would like to thank in particular Rosny Desroches and Vania Berrouët of FONHEP; Ramsès Camy of ADEPH; Delille Antoine of CEEC; and the representative of FEPH; Maël Fouchard of l’Imprimerie Deschamps; Jean-Edouard Baker, President of the Presidential Commission on Growth and Economic Modernization; Thierry Gardère, President of ADIH; and Antoine Levelt, Director of FPN. A special mention goes to Ralph Auguste, President of Educat S.A. and member of the Presidential Commission on Growth and Economic Modernization, who generously gave his time for thoughtful and provocative discussion with members of the Diagnosis team.

We must finally thank the different members of the RTI/AED/Educat S.A. team who produced the subsystem reports. These included, for basic education, Nirvah Jean-Jacques (consultant to Educat S.A.), Vania Berrouët (consultant to Educat S.A.), Luc Gilbert (consultant to AED), and Michaëlle St Natus (Educat S.A.), whose pep and initiative spirit were irreplaceable ingredients for the organization of focus-group meetings in the departments; Guy Maximilien (consultant to Educat S.A.) and Myrna Norris (consultant to AED) for the report on secondary education; Joan Cohen (consultant to AED) on preschool education; Maurice Garnier (consultant to AED) who collaborated with Jacky Lumarque on higher education; Ann Dodge (consultant to AED) on non-formal education; and Marc Botti (consultant to RTI) who prepared the analysis of the financial aspects of the educational system. Jacky Lumarque produced the study of technical and professional education; Jean Georges Dehasse and Jacky Lumarque that of the system's management and administration. Amy Mulcahy and Daniel Gifondorwa of RTI contributed to the statistical and demographic analyses of the educational system.

The supporting teams of RTI, AED, and Educat S.A. have also effectively contributed to the execution of the task. We would like to mention Daniel Gifondorwa, RTI resident in Port-au-Prince, Giselle Bonet-Dodd at RTI; Francy Hays, Lorecia Roland and Ellie Abrams at AED, and Junie Chéry at Educat S.A. Finally we benefitted all through our journey from the enlightened comments and feedback of Luis Crouch at RTI who with Charles Tardieu conceived the project "Technical Support to Haiti’s Education Policy Reform and Planning Process", of which the technical diagnosis is only one of several components. We hope that the results of this diagnosis provide useful information and lessons for continued efforts in the elaboration of educational policies in Haiti and elsewhere.

Port-au-Prince, 18 September 1995

Jean Georges Dehasse
Director of the Diagnosis
Consultant to AED

Jacky Lumarque
Coordinator of the Educat S.A. team
Consultant to RTI

Jennie Spratt
RTI Project Director
THE TECHNICAL DIAGNOSIS TEAM

Team direction

Jean Dehasse and Jacky Lumarque.

Research and reporting

Vania Berrouet, Marc Botti, Joan Cohen, Jean Dehasse, Ann Dodge, Maurice Garnier, Luc Gilbert, Nirvah Jean-Jacques, Jacky Lumarque, Guy Maximilien, Myrna Norris, Michaëlle St Natus, and Jennie Spratt.

Assistance to research and analysis


Critical review of report drafts


Logistical and administrative support

INTRODUCTION

THE MANDATE

The "National Education Plan 2004" (PNE 2004) is a project of the MENJS which was put in place with the support and cooperation of USAID, UNESCO, and UNICEF in order to elaborate a strategic plan of education in Haiti at the national level. PNE 2004 was given a period of one year in which to prepare this strategic plan, using a process of consultation and participation intended to involve all actors concerned with education in Haiti.

To assist in the realization of this plan, PNE 2004 has benefitted from the technical assistance of Research Triangle Institute (RTI) through a cooperative agreement with the USAID Mission in Haiti. This agreement, entitled "Technical Support to Haiti’s Education Policy Reform and Planning Process" aims to formulate strategies to improve the country’s institutional capacities to design, promote, and implement better policies in the planning, management, finance, and delivery of education. One of the main activities foreseen in the frame of the agreement was the execution of a technical diagnosis of the educational system. This diagnosis was achieved by RTI, AED, and Educat S.A. in full and constant collaboration.

STUDY OBJECTIVES

The technical diagnosis of the educational system had two principal objectives. The first was to achieve a quick appraisal of the system, intended to identify the critical operational problems and current practices in the functioning of the system. Accent is placed, therefore, on the analysis of institutional functioning and performance so as to bring to light the "policies by default" that lie at the core of the basic decisional process. The second objective was to obtain the opinions and interpretations of the system's principal actors and beneficiaries on its problems.

In defining the objectives and recommended methodology for the study, the concept of "diagnosis" was preferred to that of "assessment" for at least two reasons. The first responds to the urgency of the need to establish as quickly as possible a clear, comprehensive picture of the current state of the educational system, as a starting point for the elaboration of a strategic reform plan. The second has to do with the fact that the system under study is currently in complete disarray, on which quantitative data are rare, sketchy and not very reliable. Despite these difficulties, the maximum of available quantitative data was collected, with special attention paid to information regarding the performance of the system and its educational and managerial practices.

The technical diagnosis employed a participative approach which has been applied with success in other countries and which has been shown to contribute substantially (i) to developing a sense among participants that the process of diagnosis and the educational policies which result from it are everybody's business, and (ii) to eliciting “the facts” as seen and interpreted by the actors, beneficiaries, and managers of the system, so as to situate the findings based on statistical data alone within the context of their real practical relevance. The methodology also calls attention to schools, institutes, and universities as responsible organizational entities which possess a certain
autonomy of decision, rather than simply sources of statistical data or consumers of inputs. In fact, these actors contributed also to the realization of diagnosis.

REPORTS

The report entitled *Diagnostic Technique du Systeme Educatif Haitien* represents one stage in a process of ongoing involvement and consultation, and contributed to the enlargement of that process. Far from being a definitive report, it aims to feed reflection, by delivering to the actors a corpus of basic information and analysis results on the educational system and its environment. These elements are to be folded back into the process of development of new educational policies, in order to enrich this work through debate and dialogue grounded on fact but without losing sight of the needs and perceptions of the different actors, clients, and suppliers of systems. A rich and varied body of material was collected during numerous field visits and interviews, to which the present report, fault of time and means, doesn't entirely do justice. All material and documentation collected have been delivered to the MENJS, so that its technicians, and those of its partners, can further exploit them.

The complete report, in French, comprises three parts and a series of annexes. Part One contains three chapters, in which are successively described and analyzed (a) the general features of Haiti’s educational system and its immediate context; (b) the management of the system at the central, departmental level and in the establishments; and (c) the financing of the system. In six separate chapters, Part Two presents the diagnoses of preschool, basic, general secondary, professional and technical, higher, and nonformal education. Part Three presents the conclusions and recommendations of the entire report. The whole is completed by statistical tables and appendices relating to the different chapters, and a bibliography of references.

A somewhat shorter *Rapport de Synthese*, prepared for broader distribution, presents the content of the complete report in abridged form, and provides the entire set of statistical tables. It is intended as a starting point for more in-depth discussions leading to a process of educational policy reform and the formulation of a strategic plan to improve system performance. The report begins by developing three dominant aspects of the system which to a large degree explain both its nature and its working. These are: the strength of private initiatives in education, the weakness of system management in the public sector, and the financial realities which both state and society must confront. The major challenges and problems specific to each subsystem are then presented, with preschool, primary and secondary subsystems treated together because of the similarity of problems and findings observed. The synthesis concludes with the recommendations as presented in the complete Diagnosis report.

The present "Executive Summary" of the diagnosis presents its major findings, conclusions, and recommendations.
SUMMARY OF CONCLUSIONS

Education in Haiti has suffered the effects of the profound disruptions in Haitian society as a whole, characterized by alternating episodes of anarchy, abuse of state control and authority, and abdication of that authority. Haitian education deserves to be rehabilitated in its dignity.

This task falls to the State, which must contribute to strengthening the educational system and rendering it able, if not to remove itself entirely from the path of society’s passions, then at least to resist them. For schooling is a serious business for civil society, which allocates the largest part of its available resources to that end: roughly 3.4 billion Gourdes per year, or six times more than the contribution of the State. And the stakes are high for the collectivity, which can only master its fate through a program of (re)construction designed and oriented toward the future. It is the idea of a new School, renewed and reconceptualized according to the objectives of modernization and the reassertion of citizen and community as important entities, that can bring an end to the perpetual cycle of illusory reforms. Under these conditions, students, teachers, managers, and all of society will find in the school, or will make of it, the mold that will give form to their future.

The analysis of Haiti’s educational system conducted through this technical diagnosis raises issues of an alarming gravity. Indeed, one is struck:

- by the lure, whose victims are both parents and students, of a ritual in which the former lose their investment and the latter are deprived of the intellectual tools they seek to achieve their dreams of fulfillment. Students of all ages are searching for a real education. This demand for quality is evident in the types of knowledge and skills that are sought through the diverse channels of education and training. If the State, or more specifically, the Ministry of Education, accepts that a public good as important as education -- of which it is furthermore the guarantor before society -- is put on the market by private operators motivated by the search for profit, it is also the duty of the authorities to ensure that the services provided offer the level of quality desired. This duty is not limited simply to the notion of consumer protection, but more importantly, involves respect for the conditions that hold in the regulation of a social contract.

- by the opacity and, thus, the non-democratic character of a system of education that reveals little of itself, that neither documents nor renders public the most elementary information on its functioning and performance. In several instances, the diagnosis calls attention to the deficiencies that characterize the production of information, and the difficulty of constructing a planning horizon that would guide future choices. The propensity of Ministries of Education in general to chase after illusory and grandiose formal goals, at the cost of neglecting simple, realistic, and attainable objectives, is well-known. A system which refuses to engage in transparency, self-assessment, and communication with its environment; a system which feeds off its restricted vision only, while neglecting the horizon of strategic planning; closes itself off from its own transformation and condemns itself to inertia and death.

- by the strong demand for education, expressed in (a) a net enrollment rate in urban settings that increases by 4.2 percent per year; (b) an exceptional contribution by households to the financing of education, which represented an estimated 12 percent of the gross domestic
product (GDP) in 1994; (c) a major contribution to the provision of educational services by the private sector, which provides over 80 percent of the country’s primary schools, and an equivalent portion of its secondary schools; and (d) attempts to structure the private sector through networks intended to extend or complete the role of the Ministry in teacher training, support, and supervision. There are very few countries in the world in which the private sector’s effort in offering educational services reaches such an important proportion. This situation poses both a threat and an opportunity for Haiti, depending on the manner in which the authorities choose to face it.

The analysis also reveals the weakness of the guardian institutions to formulate or document a coherent policy for the different educational levels. Caught between the pressures of funding organizations in search of quick answers and the numerous solicitations of its different clients, the Ministry of Education does not appear able to play its role adequately.

The weak performance and anarchical functioning of the system find their origin in the weakness of its public management. This phenomenon can be explained in part by the limited resources of the government institutions but especially by styles of management which result in a lack of educational policy and strategic planning, a lack of continuity in the application of reform policies, and the absence or deficiencies of operational systems.

The absence of educational policy and strategic planning is shown in the successive reorganizations of the Ministry which, despite an apparent movement toward greater efficiency, have left numerous operational units without precise missions (notably DEF, DES, and BUGEP), or burdened with tasks that do not correspond to their official mission (DDEs) or that appear to duplicate or conflict with those of other units (such as DPCE, PNE 2004, and UPED). This absence of clarity of mission is evident also in the case of the INFP, invested as it is with multiple and contradictory missions, and in that of the UEH Rectorate, whose relationship with the Ministry and whose role vis-a-vis the private universities and other institutions of higher education are highly ambiguous. These frequent reorganizations, conducted in confusion and beyond a legal framework, have engendered institutional instability and have led to estrangement and apathy among government officials.

The predominant management practice, based on improvisation and crisis management, is equally responsible. Too often, quick decisions are taken in reaction to the problem of the hour, with little contribution from technical services in the decision-making process, and without reference to written operational procedures or regulations. In addition, the top levels of the management hierarchy tend to be heavily involved in day-to-day administrative actions, ignoring the technical services, and neglecting their own primary responsibilities of formulating and executing educational policies, strategic planning, and coordinating technical services. Such an informal management style is found in the service units of the Ministry, and notably in the DDEs, the INFP, and the UEH Rectorate. The absence of functioning document archives and information systems increases the necessity of (emergency) meetings, at which solutions are reached by summoning the collective institutional memory.

Other aspects to be stressed include the following.
A LACK OF CLARITY IN EDUCATIONAL POLICY

Educational policy in Haiti continues to be inspired primarily by the legal decree of 1982 which set out the last educational reform. Applied before a national consensus could be obtained, that reform was marked from the start, despite extensive preparation, by a certain precipitousness which led at times to confusion among parents, school directors, and Ministry officials. Periodic circulars from the Ministry, and especially the decree of 1989, were needed to provide the necessary clarifications. All the educational subsystems still carry the traces of this earlier deficiency in educational policy.

RUPTURES IN THE APPLICATION OF THE REFORM

The structure of the reformed educational system, that is, the articulation of educational tracks and programs as defined by the Reform of 1982 which aimed to eliminate the rigidity of the traditional structure by opening options toward employment at different levels of the system, was not fully implemented as anticipated. The signs of stoppage and delay which emanated from the public authorities brought skepticism and distrust among both parents and teachers. The confusion surrounding the “Fundamental School” (“l’Ecole Fondamentale”), at times perceived as an administrative unit, at times as an educational structure, is still widespread; the contradictory messages sent by the Ministry concerning the duration of each cycle, and the lack of clarity in the objectives assigned to pre-professional and professional tracks, has increased uneasiness and delayed consensus on a common vision shared by all actors.

DEFICIENCIES IN OPERATIONAL PROCEDURES

The Direction of Personnel of MENJS admits to the absence of administrative procedures to govern human resource management. In both private and public sectors, the recruitment of teachers proceeds outside established norms, or in the absence of any norms whatsoever for the private sector. Staff supervision, evaluation, and promotion occur in like fashion. As for the procedures of public finance, heavy and rigid, they appear to be more concerned with curbing expenses than with facilitating the execution of programs. They do not, however, prevent the budgetary manipulations that are essential to the resolution of crisis situations and, thereby, to institutional survival. The procedures employed by the DAA are conceived exclusively as the regulation or control of expenses (from commitment to liquidation) and unfortunately limit the involvement of the technical services in budgetary planning.

More than one service of MENJS (e.g., Genie Scolaire, BCEP, and DFP) function according to procedures that they developed themselves and that were never taken into account, let alone promulgated, by the authorities. This type of situation confirms the hierarchy’s lack of attention to control or regulation, assures the predominance of the spoken word over written formulations, and favors informal transactions in the search for solutions. Managerial practices are not governed by operational procedures, for the simple reason that there is no sanction against the nonrespect of such procedures. In consequence, regulatory activity becomes gratuitous and without relevance.
There exist, however, some points of contact between this “nonformal” or “informal” type of management and the formal systems, such as the new teacher’s insertion on the Ministry of Finance payroll; the national examinations, etc.

THE WEAKNESS OF STRUCTURES OF SUPERVISION AND TRAINING SUPPORT

Central and departmental structures charged with the management of the system have little impact on schools. They lack sufficient human and financial resources to accomplish the tasks of control, management, supervision, training, and pedagogical support. A similar situation exists between the UEH Rectorate and its institutes and faculties.

MENJS currently engages fewer than 300 inspectors and educational advisors to monitor and supervise the performance of more than 11,000 public and private primary and secondary schools. Only 10 percent of private primary schools and 30 percent of private secondary schools were operating with a license at the end of 1994, indicating an extremely limited impact of the state’s power of decision to grant licences, as well as its weak capacity -- or will -- to apply the norms. The INFP provides no pedagogical training or support to technical schools, which are left to their own devices; their relationship with the Institute is reduced primarily to the delivery of teachers’ salary checks. The absence of a structure for the coordination of higher education is painfully felt, and increases the confusion surrounding the role of UEH in the management of the subsystem. The Faculties and Schools attached to the UEH Rectorate function as independent institutional enclaves, falling outside its institutional evaluation and managerial control, duplicating tracks and programs, operating without unity of vision or orientation toward the future, and drowning the managerial responsibility of the leadership in collective, "ad hoc" entities with vague terms of reference.

THE EVOLVING ROLE OF THE DEPARTMENTAL DIRECTIONS

Each of the ten departmental directions (DDEs) of MENJS has the mandate to assure the supervision and training support of all public and private schools in the Department, through the use of regional educational advisors (CPRs) and departmental inspectors. These CPRs and inspectors have distinct tasks, the former being concerned primarily with pedagogy and the latter with educational administration. The jurisdiction of the DDEs extends essentially to preschool, primary / fundamental, and general secondary subsystems. Technical and professional secondary schools continue to be supervised centrally by the INFP, though with little effectiveness as previously reported.

Recently, all services of the DDEs were regrouped under the authority of the departmental director, who alone assures the linkage with the central structure of MENJS. Thus for example, the CPR who previously reported directly to the central administration (DFP) now reports to the departmental director; some Departments dispose of their own school construction units. The interlocutor of the departmental director at the central level is the General Direction of MENJS, to which is attached a Bureau of Coordination.
This process of decentralization will constitute a positive step to the extent that it leads toward the establishment of a competent body of departmental directors, thanks to initial and continued training, and the application of recruitment criteria that are based on appropriate qualifications. One may identify two potential obstacles against which appropriate precautions should be taken. The first is the possibility of resistance to the process of decentralization on the part of the central directions, which must be countered by encouraging these directions to transcend the natural inertia of their prior functions and to facilitate the change process. The second apparent danger, which has materialized elsewhere, is to produce a new bureaucracy, recentralized at the Department level, in which would be drowned the fundamental objectives of decentralization in the first place -- to improve the quality of education. The devices of quality control function at their best when they are near the operators; this is why the role of the DDE is crucial for the continuing amelioration of educational system. The effort of decentralization must therefore be accompanied by a certain rigor in the definition of the profile corresponding to the departmental director’s position: the responsibilities of the position, the limits of its power, and the concern to truly develop the necessary expertise. For example, a departmental director too much engaged in politics places in jeopardy the education of all of the Department’s children.

FINANCIAL REALITIES

The crisis had serious repercussions on the economy of the country, on household incomes, and on the size of public expenditure, resulting in a deterioration in the offer of education. Four years later, despite a strong nominal increase in budgetary appropriations in 1994-95, the education sector finds itself with resources that have not actually increased in real terms (due to monetary depreciation), while student enrollments have grown substantially in the interval. The salary adjustment recently obtained by teachers, representing an important aggregate amount, is capable of provoking a budgetary imbalance (in particular, a reduction in operating credits) without necessarily giving satisfaction to its recipients: the agreed increases are far from reaching, in terms of purchasing power, the 1987 wage level already judged insufficient.

Another aspect of the financial constraints is the difficulty of mobilizing sufficient resources to finance investments in and functioning of technical education and professional training. The dominant paradigms among funding agencies currently hinder greatly the financing of these forms of education, especially in the context of countries such as Haiti. School directors themselves must think of novel financing formulas capable of increasing their negotiating power with lenders, who are always willing to accompany efficient national initiatives. In any event, one must recall that even when investments are financed through international cooperation, the responsible local parties must face up to the payment of recurrent costs. A larger involvement on the part of enterprises as well as beneficiaries in financing education and training must therefore become an objective to consider, so as to raise the necessary funds to cover operating costs.

INCREASING USER CONTRIBUTIONS

It is well established that higher and university education offers the highest degree of private returns to the individual. Efficiency in the allocation of public resources therefore logically
demands a larger share of user contribution to finance this level of education. These considerations are particularly pertinent in the Haitian context, where the financing of education seems to follow a paradoxical pattern, according to which the financing effort by parents (or users) decreases as the level of education increases. This pattern means simply that society inflicts on the most impoverished a transfer of revenues toward the most comfortable classes. Such anomalies have a tendency to last, because the beneficiary classes generally possess greater powers of negotiation with the political authorities. The refusal of students of UEH to contribute to the financing of their education also draws on this logic of defense of privileges.

Due to these considerations, one spontaneous response generated by a number of private initiatives -- to offer quality university education -- is full of promise for the community and should consequently attract the support of the public authorities given its potential for equity and efficiency. Such a choice does not however relieve the State of its responsibility with regard to social promotion, a responsibility which should be expressed through initiatives that favor access to better training for underprivileged students. It is within this context that such instruments as grants and educational credit programs should be placed.

RESTORING THE VALUE OF THE TEACHING PROFESSION

The teaching profession is currently devalued in Haitian society, a fact which explains the dissatisfaction of teachers, their lack of trust in the system, their difficulty in imagining a career in the profession, and their lack of interest in the life of the school. This state of mind explains the deterioration in the quality of teachers recruited and that of the teaching dispensed. An important need exists to restore the dignity of the teaching profession, without question by improving teachers’ working conditions, and by requiring in return greater intellectual rigor.

* * *

The challenges described above are indeed sizeable but they are not beyond the potential of the actors involved. Moreover, the problem of modernizing the Haitian educational apparatus is less a technical problem than it is a political one. It is in this sense that the Technical Diagnosis, and the National Education Plan itself, must call out to the politicians and obtain their courageous commitment in favor of an educational system that is modern, effective, and equitable.
RECOMMENDATIONS FOR A STRATEGY

Haitian society invests enormous resources in education. As has been emphasized elsewhere, the efforts of parents represent more than 85 percent of the country’s financial contribution to the system. This impressive strength of private initiatives does not call into question the legitimate vocation of the Ministry of Education to guide the educational system as a whole. Nonetheless, lacking control over the amount of Government resources allocated to education, one of the Ministry’s most realistic and important objectives is to seek to optimize the use of resources mobilized for education at the national level. This choice implies for the Ministry a three-part process: (1) reestablishing its proper role as the regulator of an educational apparatus which extends beyond the public schools alone; (2) putting devices in place so as to guarantee the quality and accessibility of education at all levels of the system; and (3) redistributing its own internal resources in order to reflect and support through financing the recognized priorities of the different levels and types of education, and at the same time to increase the efficiency of resource use.

For example, as suggested in numerous group discussions facilitated by the consultants, the strengthening and rigorous application of procedures of accreditation (through the conferral and withdrawal of operating licenses) and certification (through national examinations), and the provision of financial support on the basis of criteria of pedagogical efficiency, are tools that can positively influence the quality of education, encouraging as they do the improvement of services offered by the schools. Likewise, the diversification of mechanisms for financing technical and higher education, through instruments such as educational credit programs, can serve to enhance accessibility and efficiency.

The present section summarizes the principal recommendations inspired by the state of affairs as described in the Diagnosis. These recommendations are addressed to the drafters of the National Education Plan who, along with other actors in the sector, are enjoined to test and validate their relevance and feasibility. In the short term, they can also serve the Ministry by shedding additional light on current efforts for ongoing educational improvements. On the whole, most of the recommendations retained here emerged from numerous exchanges with actors of the system working at different levels of intervention and responsibility. To a certain degree, and given the present circumstances, they represent a convergence of opinion on which most actors encountered during the diagnosis came to agree in the course of group meetings, workshops, and panel discussions.

RECOMMENDATION No 1      Develop tools of quality control

To improve the quality of education, it is recommended that the Ministry elaborate and implement a strategy of quality control and supervision, using the tools of (i) subvention with conditions; (ii) the conferral of operational licenses; (iii) standard examinations, and (iv) the creation of pedagogical commissions.

The MENJS already possesses several of the tools suited to this objective, though some of these still require clarification in more operational terms. One such tool is financial support or
subvention, combined with respect of the conditions which govern it. It will be necessary to develop a policy of award which is based on criteria of relevance (according to the levels, types and modalities of training which should have priority in a given region) and quality (such as qualifications of teaching and management staff, respect of educational norms and programs, etc.)

A second tool is accreditation, the power of conferral and withdrawal of license or authorization for a private school to function, subject to a set of criteria. These criteria exist (although they are not yet promulgated) and are taken into account by the BCEP. The efficacy of this type of control, however, requires a capacity for supervision that is far superior to that which currently exists.

A third mechanism of quality control is the standard examination, insofar as it is composed appropriately and applied with rigor. To ensure that such examinations constitute a real test of the internal validity of the system, however, a number of conditions must be met. First, the local communities of parents must be informed of results in all schools in their district; second, they must be convinced of the validity of these results; and finally, they must be informed of the relationship between the examination results and the quality of services offered in the schools.

A fourth tool is to require every school to establish a pedagogical commission that would oversee school management with regard to the application of programs and the search for continuous improvement. One advantage of this last tool is that it transfers the responsibility for quality control to the level of the operators themselves, thus reducing the need for external supervision.

It is suggested that the MENJS, in collaboration with the private education networks, put together a strategy that combines these four instruments of quality control, and employ their agents (DDE inspectors and educational advisors, and private sector monitors) in the implementation of this strategy.

RECOMMENDATION No 2 Reinforce and consolidate the private education networks

It is recommended that the Ministry of Education encourage the creation of decentralized networks for the improvement of the quality of educational services. The process of decentralization which has begun with the strengthening of the authorities of the Departmental Directions of Education (DDE) and the extension of their capacities of intervention, is without doubt one of the most important actions in the Ministry’s strategy to increase the efficiency of the educational system. The improvement of quality can occur by enlisting private school networks to carry out institutional relay functions which would permit the extension of Ministerial control over schools, and facilitate the implementation of new pedagogical habits. Using private education networks as channels for interaction between the Ministry and the schools reduces the Ministry’s system management costs, while taking advantage of the potential for efficiency created by the intermediary organizations’ relative physical proximity to their affiliated schools.

Translated in operational terms, this recommendation would imply for the actors some of following objectives:
1. Strengthen the bonds between private sector monitors and DDE inspectors so as to ensure greater consistency in the type of supervision and support given to schools, and to better define the respective roles of the State and the private sector in improving the quality of teaching.

2. Provide support to local, grassroots structures which respond to the deficiencies of the national networks, through a DDE that is truly decentralized and endowed with the means for appropriate action.

3. Redefine the role of major private sector networks so that they can concentrate on activities for which they have distinctive expertise, such as the development of curricula, the elaboration of training programs, and the performance evaluation of teachers and pupils. This role would be similar to that of a private educational research institution capable of responding to specific needs of MENJS central directions or DDEs.

RECOMMENDATION No 3  Strengthen institutional capacities in policy analysis and strategic planning

It is recommended that MENJS strengthen its capacities in the field of strategic planning and policy analysis. In particular, the necessity to establish a system of reliable information on the functioning and performance of the educational system is crucial and cannot be delayed. The Direction of Planning has the potential necessary to undertake this effort, and should be invested with the mandate and the resources to pilot this initiative as soon as possible. Simultaneously, the private networks are urged, in consultation with the Ministry, to overhaul or improve their own systems of information, such that they will be compatible with the general information framework to be put in place.

RECOMMENDATION No 4  Diversify the mechanisms of education financing

It is recommended that the Ministry of Education diversify its mechanisms of education financing, notably by exploiting existing opportunities for the financing of technical and higher education. Appealing to mechanisms of educational credit could contribute to increased accessibility and efficiency of these levels of education. The installation of these programs could benefit from the accumulated experiences of most countries in the region, which have used such mechanisms for over twenty years. A second mechanism to consider is the development of (revenue-generating) services to the community, such as training courses, research and expert counsel, and productive work realized in the workshops of professional training centers.
RECOMMENDATION No 5  Strengthen communication and consultation

It is recommended that the Ministry of Education develop and strengthen permanent mechanisms of communication and consultation among education actors. This recommendation would be applied through different modalities appropriate to the level of education being treated.

Improving communication between the MENJS central direction and the DDEs, as well as strengthening institutional support to the DDEs, are advised, so as to free these latter from Department delegates’ undue influence and intervention in the management of education.

It is also advisable to sensitize communities and seek their involvement in the exercise of educational responsibility. The collaboration of parents in particular may be encouraged by involving them in school decisions and by inviting them to benefit, upon request, from the opportunities for training and activity that the school can offer as a place of social and cultural encounter.

Strengthening mechanisms of consultation between the public education sector, companies, and workers in the definition, follow-up, and evaluation of policies of professional training. Numerous formulae for tripartite consultation exist, some of which have been successfully piloted. The State must take the initiative to bring about and maintain partnerships with other actors in the society, not only for reasons of efficiency but also because such mechanisms contribute to the development of a constructive climate of social dialogue.

RECOMMENDATION No 6  Articulate the levels of education and rationalize its content depending on the outlets of the job market and the productive sector

There exists an urgent need to clarify the definition of “fundamental schooling” (“l’école fondamentale”) in order to specify its length as well as the educational and administrative organization foreseen or recommended for its implementation. More generally, structures of receiving new entrants which is based on a rational policy for managing the phenomenon of over-aged students should be put in place, in order to relieve congestion in schools of the formal type and permit them to admit younger pupils according to the admission criteria of basic formal education. In parallel, elaborating an accelerated curriculum for over-aged students would serve to reduce the number of such students in the short term until the phenomenon, which hinders the educational access and normal progress of school-age children, is fully eradicated over the longer term.

Currently, secondary education in Haiti is characterized mainly by: (1) a steady increase in the number of students and their enrollment primarily in private establishments; and (2) a linear progression of coursework which offers no formal means of exit toward professional life outside of entry into the university. The system will need to leave the beaten trails while being open to the experiences of other countries, in order to redefine its technical training programs on a more coherent basis. Economists, the world of business, educators, and parents should be extensively
consulted before decisions on the styles and types of professional formation to be put in place are taken.

**RECOMMENDATION No 7  Strengthen and rationalize the preparation of educational management staff at all levels**

The personnel of MENJS and the DDEs require training in administrative tasks, organizational tasks, and tasks of supervision. One may envisage (1) staff training in techniques of supervision and planning as a means to complement the process of decentralization of activities; (2) training in the use of statistics and the exploitation of data collected in the field in order to establish the system’s internal and external efficiency, the performance of students, the weaknesses and strengths of the curriculum, etc., and (3) concentrating school-level actions on the school directors and their training, so that they become focal points in the process of transforming and maintaining the school as a real center of learning.

**RECOMMENDATION No 8  Restore the value of the teaching profession**

The two principal problems identified regarding the teaching profession -- that is, the low level of teachers’ qualification and their extreme mobility -- can find solution only through restoring the value of the teaching profession. The "ad hoc" decisions of salary adjustment must be viewed in a more comprehensive framework, taking into account not only the status of teachers but the necessity of requiring, in return, their greater availability in the classroom and their commitment to continued training for qualification. In this sense, the revision and application of teacher statutes remain a condition *sine qua non* to attract greater numbers of qualified human resources toward the profession and to bring the mass of active but unqualified teachers to participate in various training actions.

A concerted plan among the different education partners should permit the adoption of a suitable strategy in order to attain, by 2004, the eradication of the ranks of non-qualified teachers. The DFP will need to possess adequate structures to coordinate the implementation of this plan of action, and to bring the necessary support to the different partners concerned, in particular those of the private sector.
ANNEX: METHOD OF THE DIAGNOSIS

The technical diagnosis of Haiti’s educational system was performed by consultants and staff of the firms RTI, AED, and Educat S.A., these last two under subcontract to RTI, from December 1994 to July 1995. The consultants achieved most of the work, in which the technicians of PNE 2004 and the personnel of the RTI team also participated.

Each consultant responsible for a given subsystem received precise instructions to organize his or her work around the four following guidelines: (1) review the available literature and statistical data pertaining to the subsystem; (2) update the data on the subsystem, carrying out swift investigations as necessary; (3) focus one’s study on the management of the subsystem and its real mechanisms of functioning; and (4) identify the perceptions of actors and beneficiaries on the subsystem’s modes of functioning, performance, crucial problems, and solutions. To accomplish this work, the team made use of focus group techniques, brainstorming meetings, structured interviews, open interviews with key informants, and written questionnaires.

The execution of the mandate posed a real challenge, based on the novel character of the participatory approach, the logistical constraints linked to the fact that Haiti was emerging from three years of trade embargo, and the difficulties of gathering basic documentation that were inherent in the local context. The diagnostic operation, once launched, required establishing an entire logistical arrangement for the organization of numerous meetings and workshops in Port-au-Prince and especially in the departments. Managing the contributions of actors, beneficiaries, and technicians who hailed from varied horizons, and organizing participatory meetings in an unstructured and at times emotionally charged environment, were arduous tasks.

Several national consultants participated in the realization of this Diagnosis. Their contribution was invaluable, as they spontaneously placed the problems of the hour in historic perspective, giving a depth to the domain being reviewed and offering a better perception of the problems of content, thereby permitting the reader to distinguish old and well-rooted tendencies (such as the volatile character of the teaching profession, already denounced in 1891) from more recent phenomena such as the proliferation of new schools. The long visits to the departments, which sometimes involved the mobilization of several hundred persons, would not have been possible without the initiative and on-the-spot planning of Educat S.A. staff and consultants.